# **WEST VIRGINIA LEGISLATURE**

### **2025 REGULAR SESSION**

#### Introduced

## Senate Bill 264

FISCAL NOTE

By Senator Stuart

[Introduced February 12, 2025; referred to the Committee on the Judiciary; and then to the Committee on Finance]

Intr SB 264 2025R1159

A BILL to amend and reenact §61-2-2 of the Code of West Virginia, 1931, as amended; to amend the code by adding eleven new sections, designated §61-2-2a, §61-2-2b, §61-2-2c, §61-2-2d, §61-2-2e, §61-2-2f, §61-2-2g §62-7-4, §62-7-5, §62-7-6, and §62-7-6a; and to repeal §61-11-2 and §62-3-15 of said code, relating to permitting the death penalty for first degree murder for the crime of intentional killing of a law-enforcement officer or first responder in the line of duty; providing for procedures, standards, and findings applicable to imposition thereof in certain instances, including aggravating and mitigating circumstances; sentencing; providing automatic review of the death penalty by the Supreme Court of Appeals; providing for forensic DNA testing of biological material in death penalty cases; providing for execution of the death sentence by any legally acceptable means, including lethal injection or firing squad; providing for delivery of sentence of death to officer retaining custody of person so sentenced; providing for transmission of indictment, order of conviction, sentence, and judgment entered thereon to the warden of the state correctional facility; transferring of person sentenced to death to the state correctional facility; execution; providing presence of certain persons be requested for the execution; providing for certification that sentence of death has been executed; and providing for disposition of the body.

Be it enacted by the Legislature of West Virginia:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

1

2

3

4

#### **CHAPTER 61. CRIMES AND THEIR PUNISHMENT.**

**ARTICLE** 2. **CRIMES AGAINST** THE PERSON. §61-2-2. **Penalty** for murder in first degree. Any person convicted of murder of in the first degree shall be punished by confinement in the penitentiary for life sentenced to death if any one or more of the aggravating circumstances enumerated in §61-2-2b have been charged and found to be true without a finding of any one or more of the mitigating circumstances enumerated in §61-2-2c. Any person otherwise convicted of

5 murder in the first degree is sentenced to confinement in a state correctional facility for life without 6 probation or parole. degree. procedures for murder the first §61-2-2a. Sentencing in 1 (a) Procedure in jury trials. --2 After a verdict of murder in the first degree is recorded and before the jury is discharged, 3 the court shall conduct a separate sentencing hearing in which the jury shall determine whether 4 the defendant shall be sentenced to death or life imprisonment. In the sentencing hearing, 5 evidence may be presented as to any matter that the court determines relevant and admissible on 6 the question of the sentence to be imposed, including evidence relating to any of the aggravating 7 or mitigating circumstances specified in §61-2-2b and §61-2-2c. Evidence of aggravating 8 circumstances shall be limited to those circumstances specified in §61-2-2b. After the 9 presentation of evidence, the court shall permit counsel to present argument for and against the 10 sentence of death. The court shall then instruct the jury in accordance with subsection (c) of this 11 section. Failure of the jury to unanimously agree upon a sentence does not impeach or in any way 12 affect the guilty verdict previously recorded. 13 (b) Procedure in nonjury trials and guilty pleas. --14 If the defendant waives a jury trial or pleads guilty, the sentencing proceeding shall be 15 conducted before a jury impaneled for that purpose unless waived by the defendant with the 16 consent of the state, in which latter case the trial judge shall hear the evidence and determine the 17 penalty in the same manner as would a jury. 18 (c) Instructions to jury. --Before retiring to determine the imposition of sentence, the jury shall be instructed by the 19 20 court as to the following: 21 (1) The aggravating circumstances specified in §61-2-2b for which any evidence has been 22 presented; 23 (2) Mitigating circumstances, including those specified in §61-2-2c, for which any evidence

24	has been presented;						
25	(3) Aggravating circumstances must be proved by the state beyond a reasonable doubt						
26	Mitigating circumstances must be proved by the defendant by a preponderance of the evidence;						
27	(4) The sentence shall be a sentence of death if the jury unanimously finds the aggravating						
28	circumstance specified in §61-2-2b and no mitigating circumstance or if the jury unanimously find						
29	one or more aggravating circumstances which outweigh all mitigating circumstances. The						
30	sentence shall be life imprisonment without probation or parole in all other cases;						
31	(5) The court may discharge the jury if it is of the opinion that further deliberation will no						
32	result in a unanimous agreement as to the sentence, in which case the court shall sentence the						
33	defendant to life imprisonment; and						
34	(6) The court shall instruct the jury on any other matter that may be just and proper unde						
35	the circumstances.						
	§61-2-2b. Aggravating circumstances for imposition of capital punishment						
1	(a) When a defendant is convicted of murder in the first degree, aggravating circumstances						
2	shall be when the victim was a law-enforcement officer or first responder intentionally killed while						
3	in the performance of his or her duty;						
3	in the performance of his or her duty;						
3	in the performance of his or her duty;  (b) A finding of aggravated circumstances may not be based on circumstantial evidence						
3 4 5	in the performance of his or her duty;  (b) A finding of aggravated circumstances may not be based on circumstantial evidence but requires some physical evidence, such as forensic DNA evidence, or an uncoerced						
3 4 5	in the performance of his or her duty;  (b) A finding of aggravated circumstances may not be based on circumstantial evidence but requires some physical evidence, such as forensic DNA evidence, or an uncoerced confession.						
3 4 5 6	in the performance of his or her duty;  (b) A finding of aggravated circumstances may not be based on circumstantial evidence but requires some physical evidence, such as forensic DNA evidence, or an uncoerced confession.  §61-2-2c. Mitigating circumstances for imposition of capital punishment.						
3 4 5 6	in the performance of his or her duty;  (b) A finding of aggravated circumstances may not be based on circumstantial evidence but requires some physical evidence, such as forensic DNA evidence, or an uncoerced confession.  §61-2-2c. Mitigating circumstances for imposition of capital punishment.  When a defendant is convicted of murder in the first degree, mitigating circumstances.						
<ul><li>3</li><li>4</li><li>5</li><li>6</li><li>1</li><li>2</li></ul>	in the performance of his or her duty;  (b) A finding of aggravated circumstances may not be based on circumstantial evidence but requires some physical evidence, such as forensic DNA evidence, or an uncoerced confession.  §61-2-2c. Mitigating circumstances for imposition of capital punishment.  When a defendant is convicted of murder in the first degree, mitigating circumstances include the following:						
3 4 5 6	in the performance of his or her duty;  (b) A finding of aggravated circumstances may not be based on circumstantial evidence but requires some physical evidence, such as forensic DNA evidence, or an uncoerced confession.  §61-2-2c. Mitigating circumstances for imposition of capital punishment.  When a defendant is convicted of murder in the first degree, mitigating circumstances include the following:  (1) The defendant was under the influence of extreme mental or emotional disturbance at						

7

8	responder;							
9	(3) The defendant, at the time of the murder at issue, was 17 years old or younger;							
10	(4) The defendant's participation in the murder at issue was relatively minor; and							
11	(5) Any other evidence of mitigation concerning the character and record of the defendant							
12	and the circumstances of the murder.							
	§61-2-2d. Sentencing verdict by the jur	<u>'y.</u>						
1	After hearing all the evidence and arguments by counsel and after receiving the	<u>าе</u>						
2	instructions from the court, the jury shall deliberate and render a sentencing verdict. In rendering							
3	the verdict, the jury shall set forth in writing the findings upon which the sentence is based. Based							
4	upon these findings, the jury shall set forth in writing whether the sentence is death or life							
5	imprisonment without probation or parole.							
	§61-2-2e. Recording sentencing verdict; imposing sentence	<u>е.</u>						
1	Whenever the jury agrees upon a sentencing verdict, it shall be received and recorded l	bу						
2	the court. The court shall thereafter impose upon the defendant the sentence fixed by the jury.	<u>In</u>						
3	any case in which the death penalty is imposed, execution shall be by lethal injection.							
	§61-2-2f. Review of death sentence	<u>е.</u>						
1	(a) Whenever the death penalty is imposed and upon the judgment becoming final in the	<u>าе</u>						
2	circuit court, the sentence shall automatically be reviewed on the record by the Supreme Court	<u>of</u>						
3	Appeals. The clerk of the circuit court, within 10 days after receiving the transcript, shall transn	<u>nit</u>						
4	the entire record and transcript to the Supreme Court of Appeals together with a notice prepare	<u>∍d</u>						
5	by the clerk and a report prepared by the circuit judge. The notice shall set forth the title and dock	et						
6	number of the case, the name of the defendant and the name and address of his or her attorney,	<u>a</u>						
7	narrative statement of the judgment, the offense and the punishment prescribed. The report sha	<u>all</u>						
8	be in a standard form prepared and supplied by the Supreme Court of Appeals.							
9	(b) The Supreme Court of Appeals shall consider the punishment as well as any erro	<u>rs</u>						

the commission of the action that led to the death of the member of law enforcement or first

10	enumerated by way of appeal.
11	(c) With regard to the sentence, the Supreme Court of Appeals shall determine:
12	(1) Whether the sentence of death was imposed under the influence of passion, prejudice,
13	or any other arbitrary factor;
14	(2) Whether the evidence supports the jury's or judge's finding of a statutory aggravating
15	circumstance; and
16	(3) Whether the sentence of death is excessive or disproportionate to the penalty imposed
17	in similar cases, considering both the crime and the defendant.
18	(d) Both the defendant and the state shall have the right to submit briefs within the time
19	limitations set forth in the rules by the Supreme Court of Appeals, and to present oral argument to
20	the Supreme Court of Appeals.
21	(e) The Supreme Court of Appeals shall render a written decision which shall include a
22	reference to those similar cases which it took into consideration. The Supreme Court of Appeals,
23	with regard to review of death sentences, shall:
24	(1) Affirm the sentence of death; or
25	(2) Set the sentence aside and remand the case for resentencing by the circuit judge
26	based on the record and argument of counsel. The records of those similar cases referred to by
27	the Supreme Court of Appeals in its written decision shall be provided to the resentencing judge
28	for his or her consideration.
29	(f) The Supreme Court of Appeals may employ an appropriate staff and establish methods
30	to compile any cases or information considered by the chief justice to be appropriate and relevant
31	to the statutory questions concerning the validity of the sentence.
32	(g) The sentence review shall be in addition to direct appeal, if taken, and the review and
33	appeal shall be consolidated for consideration. The Supreme Court of Appeals shall render its
34	decision on legal errors enumerated, the factual substantiation of the verdict and the validity of the
35	sentence.

INTRODUCED 2017R1640

	<u>§61-2-2g.</u>	DNA	testing	in	death	penalty	cases.
1	<u>(a) Not</u>	withstanding	any other provis	ion of law to	the contrary, a	a person in custoc	ly pursuant
2	to the judgmer	nt of a court c	of this state in w	hich the dea	ath penalty ha	s been imposed r	nay, at any
3	time after con	viction, apply	to the court that	at entered t	ne judgment f	or forensic deoxy	ribonucleic
4	acid ("DNA") to	esting of any	biological mater	rial that:			
5	(1) Is related to the investigation or prosecution that resulted in the judgment;						
6	(2) Is in the actual or constructive possession of the state; and						
7	(3) Was not previously subjected to DNA testing or can be subjected to retesting with new						
8	DNA technique	es that provid	e a reasonable	<u>likelihood o</u>	f more accura	te and probative ı	esults.
9	<u>(b) The</u>	e court shall	notify the state	of an appli	cation made	under subsection	(a) of this
10	section and sh	all afford the	state an opporti	unity to resp	ond.		
11	(c) Upo	on receiving r	otice of an appl	ication mad	le under subse	ection (a) of this s	ection, the
12	state shall take	e such steps	as are necessar	y to ensure	that any rema	ining biological m	aterial that
13	was secured i	n connection	with the case	<u>is preserve</u>	d pending the	completion of p	roceedings
14	under this sec	tion.					
15	(d) The	court shall o	rder DNA testing	pursuant to	o an applicatio	n made under sub	section (a)
16	of this section	n upon a de	etermination tha	at testing n	nay produce	noncumulative, e	xculpatory
17	evidence relev	ant to the cl	aim of the appl	licant that t	he applicant v	vas wrongfully co	onvicted or
18	sentenced.						
19	(e) The	cost of DNA	testing ordered	under subs	section (d) of the	nis section shall b	e borne by
20	the state or the	e applicant, a	s the court may	order in the	e interests of j	ustice, if it is show	wn that the
21	applicant is no	t indigent and	d possesses the	means to p	oay.		
22	(f) The	court may at	any time appoir	nt counsel fo	or an indigent	applicant under th	nis section.
23	<u>(g) If t</u>	he results of	DNA testing c	onducted u	ınder this sec	tion are unfavora	able to the
24	applicant, the	court:					
25	<u>(1) Sha</u>	all dismiss the	e application; an	<u>d</u>			
26	<u>(2) In tl</u>	ne case of an	applicant who is	s not indige	nt, may assess	the applicant for	the cost of

27	such testing.							
28	(h) If the results of DNA testing conducted under this section are favorable to the applicant							
29	the court shall:							
30	(1) Order a hearing, notwithstanding any provision of law that would bar such a hearing;							
31	<u>and</u>							
32	(2) Enter any order that serves the interests of justice, including an order:							
33	(A) Vacating and setting aside the judgment;							
34	(B) Discharging the applicant if the applicant is in custody;							
35	(C) Resentencing the applicant; or							
36	(D) Granting a new trial.							
37	(i) Nothing in this section may be construed to limit the circumstances under which a							
38	person may obtain DNA testing or other post-conviction relief under any other provision of law.							
39	(j) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, the state shall preserve any biological							
40	material secured in connection with a death penalty case for such period of time as a person							
11	remains incard	cerated awaitir	g execution und	der a death pen	alty sentence	<u>).</u>		
	ARTICLE	11. GE	NERAL F	PROVISIONS	CONCE	RNING	CRIMES.	
	§61-11-2.	•	Capital	punis	ishment		abolished.	
1 [Repealed.]								
		СН	APTER 62.	CRIMINAL	PROCED	URE.		
	ARTICLE	3.	TRIAL	OF	CRIMI	NAL	CASES.	
	§62-3-15.	Verdict	and	sentence	in	murder	cases.	
1	[Repea	aled.]						
	ARTICLE	7.	EXECUTION	OF	SENTE	NCES;	STAYS.	
	<u>§62-7-4.</u>	Exec	Execution		death		sentence.	
1	<u>Senter</u>	nce of death, e	xcept for insurre	ection or rebellion	on, may not b	oe executed	sooner than	

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

three months after the sentence is pronounced. The sentence of death shall, in every case, be executed by any legally acceptable means, including lethal injection or firing squad. The sentence shall be executed within the walls of a state correctional facility within an enclosure prepared for that purpose and constructed so as to exclude public view. The execution shall be performed under the direction of the warden of the state correctional facility and the authorities in control thereof. The warden of the state correctional facility or, in the case of his or her death, absence or inability to act, the Commissioner of Corrections shall be the executioner. In carrying out the execution of sentence, the warden or the Commissioner of Corrections may secure the services and advice of any person or persons either considers appropriate.

# §62-7-5. Certificate of death sentence and indictment to be sent to warden; transfer of convict to a state correctional facility; persons present at execution.

The clerk of the court which pronounces the sentence of death shall, as soon as possible after sentence, deliver a certified copy of the sentence to the sheriff, who shall retain the custody of the convict sentenced to death until he or she is delivered to a properly authorized guard sent by the warden for the removal of the convict to the state correctional facility. The clerk of the court shall also forthwith transmit to the warden of the state correctional facility a copy of the indictment, order of conviction and the sentence and judgment entered thereon. As soon as possible after receipt of the copies the warden shall send a guard or guards to remove the convict to the state correctional facility. Unless a suspension of execution is ordered, the execution shall take place at the time and in the manner prescribed in the sentencing order. At the execution there may be present those officers, guards and assistants as the warden or Commissioner of Corrections considers appropriate. The warden or the commissioner, as the case may be, shall request the presence of the prosecuting attorney of the county wherein the conviction occurred, the clerk of the circuit court thereof, 12 respectable citizens, including a physician and representatives of the press as may be considered appropriate. The counsel of the convict, or any clergymen the convict may desire and any of the convict's relations may be permitted to attend. §62-7-6. Record of execution.

8

INTRODUCED 2017R1640

1 The warden or Commissioner of Corrections who executes the sentence of death shall 2 certify to the clerk of the circuit court, by which the sentence was imposed, that the sentence has 3 been executed. The clerk of the circuit court shall file the certificate with the papers of the case and 4 enter the certificate and papers upon the records of the court. §62-7-6a. Disposition of body of executed convict. 1 If the friends or relatives of the convict make a request in writing to the warden at any time 2 within two days after the sentence of death has been executed, the body of the convict shall be 3 returned to the friends or relatives, in any county in the state, for burial. The warden may draw his 4 or her order on the Auditor of the state for whatever sum is necessary to pay for transportation of 5 the body, to be paid out of funds appropriated to the Division of Corrections. If no request is made by friends or relatives, the body shall be disposed of as provided for other convicts who die within a 6 7 state correctional facility.

NOTE: The purpose of this bill is to provide for the death penalty in limited circumstances; the bill provides for procedures and standards applicable thereto, and automatic review of the penalty, for commission of murder in the first degree. Procedures for carrying out the death sentence are established.

Strike-throughs indicate language that would be stricken from a heading or the present law and underscoring indicates new language that would be added.